



South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

SENT VIA E-MAIL AND USPS:

June 5, 2019

dcasey@rialtoqa.gov

Daniel Casey, Senior Planner
City of Rialto, Development Services Department
Planning Division
150 South Palm Avenue
Rialto, CA 92376

Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) for the Proposed Riverside & Randall Gas Station Project

South Coast Air Quality Management District (South Coast AQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned document. The following comments are meant as guidance for the Lead Agency and should be incorporated into the Final MND.

South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of Project Description

The Lead Agency proposes to construct a gasoline service station with 10-fuel dispenser fueling stations and a 5,460-square-foot fuel canopy, a 7,250-square-foot convenience store with a drive-thru, a 1,750-square-foot automated carwash, and a 1,800-square-foot restaurant with a drive-thru on 2.07 acres (Proposed Project). The Proposed Project is located on the southwest corner of Riverside Avenue and Randall Avenue within the City of Rialto. Construction is anticipated to begin in 2020, and the Proposed Project will be operational by 2021¹. Upon review of the MND and aerial photographs, South Coast AQMD staff found that sensitive receptors are located within 115 feet of the Proposed Project².

Permits and Compliance with South Coast AQMD Rules

Since the Proposed Project includes the operation of a gasoline service station with 10-fuel dispenser fueling stations, a permit from South Coast AQMD will be required, and South Coast AQMD should be identified as a Responsible Agency under CEQA for the Proposed Project in the Final MND. Should there be any questions on permits, please contact South Coast AQMD's Engineering and Permitting staff at (909) 396-3385. For more general information on permits, please visit South Coast AQMD's webpage at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/permits>. In addition to a discussion³ on Rule 461 – Gasoline Transfer and Dispensing⁴, the Final MND should also include a discussion of compliance with applicable South Coast AQMD Rules, including, but not limited to, Rule 201 – Permit to Construct⁵, Rule 203 – Permit to Operate⁶, and Rule 1401 – New Source Review of Toxic Air Contaminants⁷. Any assumptions used in the Air Quality and Health Risk Assessment (HRA) analyses in the Final MND will be used as the basis for permit conditions and limits. The 2015 revised Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment

¹ MND, III Air Quality. Page 14.

² *Ibid.* Page 18.

³ *Ibid.* Page 19.

⁴ South Coast AQMD. Rule 461 – Gasoline Transfer and Dispensing. Accessed at: <https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/compliance/Gas-Dispensing/rule-461.pdf>.

⁵ South Coast AQMD. Rule 201 – Permit to Construct. Accessed at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-ii/rule-201.pdf>.

⁶ South Coast AQMD. Rule 203 – Permit to Operate. Accessed at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-ii/rule-203.pdf>.

⁷ South Coast AQMD. Rule 1401 – New Source Review of Toxic Air Contaminants. Accessed at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-xiv/rule-1401.pdf>.

(OEHHA) methodology⁸ is being used by South Coast AQMD for determining operational health impacts for permitting applications and also for all CEQA projects where South Coast AQMD is the Lead Agency. If there is any information in the permitting process suggesting that the Proposed Project would result in significant adverse air quality impacts not analyzed in the Final MND or substantially more severe air quality impacts than those analyzed in the Final MND, the Lead Agency should commit to reevaluating the Proposed Project's air quality and health risks impacts through a CEQA process (CEQA Guidelines Section 15162).

South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of the Air Quality Analysis

In the Air Quality Analysis Section, the Lead Agency quantified the Proposed Project's construction and operational emissions and compared those emissions to South Coast AQMD's recommended regional and localized air quality CEQA significance thresholds. Based on the analyses, the Lead Agency found that the Proposed Project's regional and localized air quality impacts would be less than significant⁹. Additionally, the Lead Agency prepared a Health Risk Assessment (HRA)¹⁰ and found that operation of the Proposed Project would result in a cancer risk of 8.7 in one million at the maximum impacted sensitive receptor¹¹, which would not exceed South Coast AQMD's CEQA significance threshold of 10 in one million for cancer risk¹². However, it did not appear that the land use types modeled in CalEEMod to estimate the Proposed Project's construction and operational emissions were consistent with the land uses discussed in the Proposed Project's description. Additionally, it did not appear that the Air Quality Analysis included operational ROG emissions generated from storage tanks and the fueling process during operation. Combined, these may have likely led to an underestimation of the Proposed Project's operational air quality impacts. Please see the attachment for more information. The attachment also includes a list of potential mitigation measures as resources to further reduce the Proposed Project's operational emissions that the Lead Agency should consider and incorporate in the Final MND.

Conclusion

Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15074, prior to approving the Proposed Project, the Lead Agency shall consider the MND for adoption together with any comments received during the public review process. Please provide South Coast AQMD with written responses to all comments contained herein prior to the adoption of the Final MND. When responding to issues raised in the comments, responses should provide sufficient details giving reasons why specific comments and suggestions are not accepted. There should be good faith, reasoned analysis in response. Conclusory statements unsupported by factual information do not facilitate the purpose and goal of CEQA on public disclosure and are not meaningful, informative, or useful to decision makers and the public who are interested in the Proposed Project. Further, if the Lead Agency makes a finding that additional recommended mitigation measures are not feasible, the Lead Agency should describe the specific reasons for rejecting or substituting these mitigation measures in the Final MND (CEQA Guidelines Section 15074.1).

South Coast AQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to address any air quality questions that may arise from this comment letter. Please contact Alina Mullins, Assistant Air Quality Specialist, at amullins@aqmd.gov or (909) 396-2402, should you have any questions.

⁸ Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment. "Notice of Adoption of Air Toxics Hot Spots Program Guidance Manual for the Preparation of Health Risk Assessments 2015". Accessed at: <https://oehha.ca.gov/air/cnr/notice-adoption-air-toxics-hot-spots-program-guidance-manual-preparation-health-risk-0>.

⁹ MND. III Air Quality, Pages 13 through 19.

¹⁰ South Coast AQMD. Risk Assessment Procedures for Rules 1401. Accessed at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/permits/risk-assessment>.

¹¹ MND. III Air Quality. Page 19.

¹² South Coast AQMD has developed the CEQA significance threshold of 10 in one million for cancer risk. When South Coast AQMD acts as the Lead Agency, South Coast AQMD staff conducts a HRA, compares the maximum cancer risk to the threshold of 10 in one million to determine the level of significance for health risk impacts, and identifies mitigation measures if the risk is found to be significant.

Daniel Casey

June 5, 2019

Sincerely,

Lijin Sun

Lijin Sun, J.D.

Program Supervisor, CEQA IGR

Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources

Attachment

LS:AM

SBC190521-12

Control Number

ATTACHMENT

Air Quality Analysis

Construction and Operational Emissions for the Convenience Store

1. Upon review of the Air Quality Analysis section and CalEEMod modeling output files, South Coast AQMD staff found that the land use types in CalEEMod are inconsistent with the Proposed Project's description. The Proposed Project's description states that the Proposed Project includes a gasoline service station with 10-fuel dispenser fueling stations and a 5,460-square-foot fuel canopy, a 7,250-square-foot convenience store with a drive-thru, a 1,750-square-foot automated carwash, and a 1,800-square-foot restaurant with a drive-thru¹³. In CalEEMod, the Lead Agency quantified construction and operational emissions for the restaurant and the convenience market with 20 gas pumps¹⁴, but did not quantify emissions for the 5,460-square-foot fuel canopy or the 7,250-square-foot convenience store with a drive-thru. These omissions may have led to an underestimation of the Proposed Project's construction and operational air quality impacts. Therefore, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency clarify if the 5,460-square-foot fuel canopy and the 7,250-square-foot convenience store with a drive-thru were included in the CalEEMod modeling run. Alternatively, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency revise the Air Quality Analysis to quantify emissions from constructing and operating the fuel canopy and convenience store, and include these emissions for determining the level of significance for the Proposed Project's construction and operational air quality impacts in the Final MND.

Operational ROG Emissions from Storage Tanks or Fueling Process

2. Upon a review of the Air Quality Analysis, it did not appear that the analysis included operational ROG emissions generated from storage tanks or from the fueling process during operation. This may have likely led to an underestimation of the Proposed Project's operational air quality impacts. Although South Coast AQMD Rule 461 – Gasoline Transfer and Dispensing requires the use of California Air Resources Board certified Phase I and Phase II enhanced vapor recovery systems with minimum volumetric efficiencies of 98% and 95%, respectively¹⁵, ROG emissions are not entirely eliminated from the fueling process and should be taken into consideration when analyzing the Proposed Project's operational air quality impacts. As an informational document, the Final MND should, at a minimum, include a discussion on potential operational air quality impacts from the fueling process. The Lead Agency should use its best efforts to quantify and disclose ROG emissions from the fueling process in the Final MND. If there is no substantial evidence to support a quantitative analysis of ROG emissions from the fueling process, the Lead Agency should disclose the reasons supported by factual information in the Final MND. It is also important to note that while CalEEMod¹⁶ quantifies mobile source emissions (e.g., trip visits by patrons) associated with operating a gasoline service station, CalEEMod does not quantify the operational stationary source emissions from the storage tanks and fueling equipment.

¹³ MND, I Introduction. Page 1.

¹⁴ MND. CalEEMod output files. Summer, Winter, and Annual runs.

¹⁵ South Coast AQMD. Rule 461 – Gasoline Transfer and Dispensing. Accessed at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/rule-iv/rule-461.pdf>.

¹⁶ CalEEMod incorporates up-to-date state and locally approved emission factors and methodologies for estimating pollutant emissions from typical land use development. CalEEMod is the only software model maintained by the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association (CAPCOA) and is available free of charge at: www.caleemod.com.

Additional Recommended Mitigation Measures

3. In the event that, upon revisions to the Air Quality Analysis based on Comment Nos. 1 and 2, the Lead Agency finds that the Proposed Project would result in significant adverse air quality and health risks impacts from operation, mitigation would be required (CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.4.). Therefore, South Coast AQMD staff has compiled a list of recommended mitigation measures as suggested resources and guidance to the Lead Agency to assist in the identification of feasible mitigation measures for incorporation in the Final MND. For more information on potential mitigation measures as guidance to the Lead Agency, please visit South Coast AQMD's CEQA Air Quality Handbook website¹⁷.

Mitigation Measures for Operational Air Quality Impacts from Mobile Sources

- Provide incentives for vendors and material delivery trucks that would be visiting the retail and restaurant operations to encourage the use of zero-emission or near-zero emission heavy-duty trucks during operation, such as trucks with natural gas engines that meet CARB's adopted optional NOx emissions standard of 0.02 grams per brake horsepower-hour (g/bhp-hr). At a minimum, incentivize the use of 2010 model year¹⁸ or newer engines that meet CARB's 2010 engine emission standards of 0.01 g/bhp-hr for particulate matter (PM) and 0.20 g/bhp-hr of NOx emissions or newer, cleaner trucks. Include analyses to evaluate and identify sufficient power available for zero emission trucks and supportive infrastructures in the Energy and Utilities and Service Systems Sections of the Final MND, where appropriate.
- Provide electric vehicle (EV) charging stations for the retail and restaurant uses. Require at least 5% of all vehicle parking spaces include EV charging stations, or at a minimum, require the Proposed Project to be constructed with the appropriate infrastructure to facilitate sufficient electric charging for passenger vehicles and trucks to plug-in. Electrical hookups should be provided at the onsite truck stop for truckers to plug in any onboard auxiliary equipment. Electrical panels should be appropriately sized to allow for future expanded use. The Lead Agency should also include analyses to evaluate and identify sufficient power available for zero emission trucks and supportive infrastructures (e.g., EV charging stations) in the Energy and Utilities and Service Systems Sections of the Final MND, where appropriate.
- Provide incentives for employees working at the proposed retail and restaurant uses to encourage the use of public transportation or carpooling, such as discounted transit passes or carpool rebates.
- Implement a rideshare program for employees working at the proposed retail and restaurant uses and set a goal to achieve a certain participation rate over a period of time.

Mitigation Measures for Operational Air Quality Impacts from Area Sources

- Maximize the use of solar energy including solar panels. Installing the maximum possible number of solar energy arrays on the building roofs and/or on the Proposed Project site to generate solar energy for the facility and/or EV charging stations.

¹⁷ South Coast Air Quality Management District. Accessed at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook>.

¹⁸ CARB adopted the statewide On-Road Truck and Bus Regulation in 2010. The Regulation requires diesel trucks and buses that operate in California to be upgraded to reduce emissions. Newer heavier trucks and buses must meet particulate matter filter requirements beginning January 1, 2012. Lighter and older heavier trucks must be replaced starting January 1, 2015. By January 1, 2023, nearly all trucks and buses will need to have 2010 model year engines or equivalent. More information on the CARB's Truck and Bus Regulations is available here: <https://www.arb.ca.gov/msprog/onrdiesel/onrdiesel.htm>.

- Require the use of electric landscaping equipment, such as lawn mowers and leaf blowers.
- Require use of electric or alternatively fueled sweepers with HEPA filters.
- Maximize the planting of trees in landscaping and parking lots.
- Use light colored paving and roofing materials.
- Utilize only Energy Star heating, cooling, and lighting devices, and appliances.